

*Nikolay Prymush, Yuriy Koval*

## **A multiple-aspect analysis of reforming the local government in Ukraine and Poland in the context of innovations and development prospects**

### **KEY WORDS:**

*local government, regional authority, reforming, self-organization of population, local finances, local elections*

### **Problem formulation**

The reform experience of the local government system in Poland is not treated so critically in Ukraine, and in our opinion, it is considered to be excessively idealistic. As an example, there are statements of individual politicians that emphasize the experience in Poland as the only right way of Ukraine's development, as well as published works of individual scientists who advise the Ukrainian authorities that they should regard Poland's experience as the best integration vector of Ukraine into EU area. A positive estimation of the Polish experience in Ukraine is first of all caused by the fact that Ukraine and Poland were more or less in similar social, political and economic conditions in the period of the socialist system collapse. But one must take into consideration the fact that the Ukrainian experience of reforming the local government is unique, and that is why it cannot be considered as a «necessity to transfer the Polish experience into the Ukrainian realia». The reason for this is not the fact that the Polish experience of the local government reforms eventually gave more positive results, but the Polish reformers faced a lot of problems which in the Ukrainian conditions could have a definite chance to aggravate the difficult social, political and economic situation.

The main problems in the Polish reform of the local government included the following points: elections in the representative government body on the local level (gminas, powiats), financing of the local government, distinction between the resources of rural and urban gminas. The above mentioned problems are very similar to Ukrainian problems, but Polish reformers<sup>1</sup> have not solved them so far, even despite the development of the fundamental principle of EU – subsidiarity (effective regional management) in Poland.

The main problem facing the researchers is to find out in which sphere they need to carry out the analysis of problems relating to the local government and which scientific methods can lead to logical conclusions relating to the analysis of problems concerning the local governments in Ukraine and Poland. Besides, they need to find out how to predict the prospects concerning the development of the local government in the Ukrainian and Polish realia.

## **Problem novelty**

The approach that we propose is based on the cluster analysis of development prospects concerning the local government in post-socialistic countries, innovation pattern of the local government, the idea of subsidiarity, the concept of party representation in local authorities (in the aspect of elective techniques) and the spiral evolution dynamics of the local government. The aforementioned variety of approaches allows us to consider the local government simultaneously as a multiplex prism of interconnected processes (social and political, social and economic, financial, social and cultural, political and legal, psycho emotional (memes)<sup>2</sup>), as well as political institutions serving as a connecting link between the central authorities and the citizens.

The cluster approach allows us to consider the local government simultaneously from three mutually complementary positions. We will call the first position the entrepreneurial position, because according to the statement of researcher O.V. Perevoznykova «...clusters of the first level allow to solve economic problems of the country not at the expense of the definite region, but by participation of entrepreneurial

---

<sup>1</sup> B. Janowska-Dębska, *Podstawy prawne współdziałania samorządu terytorialnego*, [w:] S. Michałowski (red.), *Samorząd terytorialny III Rzeczypospolitej. Dziesięć lat doświadczeń*, Lublin 2002, s. 79–87.

<sup>2</sup> Г. Штимицфл, Х.Шоллер, *Местное самоуправление: справочник*, Мюнхен 1995, с. 17.

and civil initiatives in terms of problem solution. The government should play here the part of a facilitator (to ensure communication success in terms of entrepreneurship-citizens-state)»<sup>3</sup>. The second position of our approach is based on the principles of civil participation both in the local authorities formation (political election), and their function in terms of civil control over the activity of the authorities, as well as the information sphere of the civil society (bio-psycho-emotional integration of citizens). The final, third position defines adaptation vectors of the innovation pattern concerning the local government in agreement with the first two positions.

### **The current character of the problem, analysis of research and unsolved problems**

The problem of the local government, in the aspects specified by us, is considered to be the total sum of interconnected processes, but at the same time this problem is not very well examined not only in the Ukrainian and Polish political ideas, but also in the worldwide practice<sup>4</sup>. The difficulty of the discussed approach lies in the following factor – its objective is to integrate all the range of local government activities into the common mechanism, but at the same time it is considered to be the total sum of interconnected clusters.

The above mentioned difficulty gives rise to a set of problems, the reason for which is the following: when scientists introduce the cluster approach into aspect examination of the local government, they somehow or other mark out only one cluster and try to examine the whole range of activities in the sphere of the local government. Therefore, there are the following approaches to the given problem in the political practice: according to Perevoznykova, Rybchinskaya and others, the cluster approach «serves only for optimization of economic problems in the specific region by means of significant expansion in the sphere of private initiative (entrepreneurship), solving the problems of the definite region, where the main role of the government is to establish com-

<sup>3</sup> О.В. Перевознікова, *Роль місцевих органів влади у процесі створення та функціонування кластерів*, [в:] *Удосконалення механізмів державного управління соціально-економічним розвитком підприємств і галузей економіки*: зб.наук.праць, Донецьк 2011, с.142.

<sup>4</sup> Л. Рибчинська, *Концептуальні підходи до формування кластерів на Хмельниччині*, „Економіст” 2008, № 10, с. 44–46.

munication (definite benefits, including taxes) between the government bodies and the private sector of economy»<sup>5</sup>. Another group of scientists (J. Sallet, O. Solvell, G. Lindqvist, Ch. Ketels) suggest applying clusters not to the system of the local government in general, but to separate sectors of the region's economy in the context of the whole country (J. Sallet)<sup>6</sup>, or to the analysis of the state budget policy in the sphere of budget rearrangement emphasizing the ecological problems that must be solved by local government (O. Solvell, G. Lindqvist, Ch. Ketels)<sup>7</sup>. The third group of scientists (Y. Baltsiy, N. Bogashova, M. Guytor, O. Pawlyk, A. Degtyarenko)<sup>8</sup> suggest considering the problem of election into the local government bodies by means of cluster analysis in the transformation context of the whole system in the local government (the functions and authorities of the local government, and also their place in the political and administrative systems). On the other hand, a Polish researcher J. Sobczak suggests forming local political parties for the purpose of citizen participation in contrast to the central authority. The approach introduced by us allows, in his opinion, «to form the local authority directly by the voters»<sup>9</sup>. The fourth approach that we suggest is called the instrumental approach, and it implies examination of the activity aspects in terms of the local government, for example, the legal aspect (V. Parhomenko and others.)<sup>10</sup>, public service and management (H.M. Deyneg and others.)<sup>11</sup>, local finances and budgets (N. Butko, E. Zelenskaya, A. Lytosh and others.)<sup>12</sup>, and a general theoretical

---

<sup>5</sup> Л. Рибчинська, *Концептуальні підходи до формування кластерів на Хмельниччині*, „Економіст” 2008, № 10, с. 44–46.

<sup>6</sup> J. Sallet, E. Paisley, *Innovation Clusters Create Competitive Communities*, „Huff Post Social News” September 21, 2009.

<sup>7</sup> O. Solvell, G. Lindqvist, Ch. Ketels, *The Cluster Initiative Greenbook*, The Competitiveness Institute/VINNOVA, Gothenburg 2003.

<sup>8</sup> О. Павлюк, *Роль політичних партій у формуванні представницьких органів місцевого самоврядування в Україні під час виборів 2010 року*, „Пам'ять століть.Планета” 2012, № 1/2, с. 62.

<sup>9</sup> J. Sobczak, *Konstytucyjne podstawy reform samorządowych w Polsce*, [w:] S. Michałowski (red.), *Samorząd terytorialny III Rzeczypospolitej. Dziesięć lat doświadczeń*, Lublin 2002, s. 41–52.

<sup>10</sup> В. Пархоменко, *Проблеми місцевого самоврядування в Україні 1990-х років*, Київ 1999, с. 35.

<sup>11</sup> Х.М. Дейнега, *Особливості підготовки державних службовців у Республіки Польща*, „Економіка та держава” 2011, № 2 (лютий), с. 159–169.

<sup>12</sup> М. Бутко, О. Зеленська, С. Зеленський, А. Літош, *Фінансова база діяльності органів місцевого самоврядування в системі критеріїв репресивності адміністративно-територіальних районів України*, „Економіст” 2011, № 11 (301), с. 38–41.

approach to the local government activity (N.V. Kaminskaya)<sup>13</sup>. The common disadvantages of the aforementioned approaches may lie in the authors' concentration only on a single aspect of the local government activity. And behind it there is a whole set of questions relating to the local government, among which we may point out the process of solution optimization in the local government by the society, and, recently, an innovation pattern. The innovation pattern, being the fifth approach to the local government, does not aim at examining the political, legal and other aspects of the local government activity. The main task of the innovation pattern in the local government is a necessity to optimize the local government activity on the first level with self-organization bodies of the population (A. Ant<sup>14</sup>, S. Mohylniy<sup>15</sup>), while on the second level reforming of the local government proceeds with an objective to organize the managers specializing in «professional management»<sup>16</sup>, and region transformation into an economically developed cell<sup>17</sup>. The third level is devoted to the problems of optimization of the first two levels, and it includes the information level in the context of the structural unit in the civil society as a participant of political processes on the local level (information credibility of the local government, and its informing about the challenges which the civil society dictates to it)<sup>18</sup>. The third level also includes the above mentioned spiral dynamics in the context of patterns relating to noetic dynamics (the psycho-emotional perception determinants of the local authority by citizens).

Thus, the cluster pattern allows us to consider the local authority as a multilevel system of authority organization, which includes a variety of interconnected aspects.

---

<sup>13</sup> Н.В. Камінська, *Місцеве самоврядування: теоретико історичний і порівняльно-правовий аналіз*, Київ 2010, с. 21–23.

<sup>14</sup> А. Ант, *Чим буде самоврядування в Україні європейським*, „Віче” 1998, № 10, с. 25–26.

<sup>15</sup> С. Могильний, *Інноваційні технології роботи місцевої влади з органами самоорганізації населення*, „Вісник Національної академії державного управління при президентіві України” 2011, № 3, с. 145–146.

<sup>16</sup> А. Ант, *Чим буде самоврядування...*, с. 26.

<sup>17</sup> С. Могильний, *Інноваційні технології роботи місцевої влади...*, с. 145–146.

<sup>18</sup> *Ibidem*, с. 146.

## **Research objective**

The objective of our research is the analysis of reforming the local government in Ukraine and in Poland in the context of innovations and its development prospects in the light of the multiple-aspect analysis.

## **A review of the principle matter. Demonstration of the obtained results**

Before we proceed to the analysis of the above mentioned positions, it is necessary to point out the peculiarities of the formation and analysis relating to the development vectors of the local government in Ukraine and Poland. It allows us to avoid the mistakes of Ukrainian reformers who suggest imitating blindly the Polish experience in the Ukrainian realia. As for the problem of reforming the local government, the Republic of Poland went towards the non-traditional direction for post-socialistic countries; here we agree with the opinion by J. Sobczak<sup>19</sup> and M. Grinishyn<sup>20</sup>. We see the need to establish extensive self-government principles in the country, where the lowest level of local authority – gmina – acts independently of the centre's will and is formed by electors. In general, the Polish reform had a definite objective: «transforming Poland into a modern competitive state, which can take up political, economic and social challenges of modern Europe and become their integrated part»<sup>21</sup>. Ukrainian reformers want to achieve their final aim, which is a diametrically opposite task – to establish the principle of an «economically developed region of well-to-do people» (motto of the ruling party)<sup>22</sup>. Such logic of Ukrainian reformers allows us to make a conclusion that the local government serves only as a structural unit of a supreme authority without the right to its own development. The position of Ukrainian law concerning the local government is clear: the local government acts as: «the right guaranteed by the state and the true ability of territorial gromada, village or voluntary integration of several villages into one village gromada, rural areas, cities in order to solve

---

<sup>19</sup> J. Sobczak, *Konstytucyjne podstawy reform samorządowych...*, s. 41–42.

<sup>20</sup> М. Гринишин, С. Трохимчук, *Місцеве самоврядування в Україні та Польщі на шляху до спільного європейського дому*, Львів 2002, с. 28–32.

<sup>21</sup> Закон України Про місцеве самоврядування в Україні, ст. 2. <http://zakon1.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/вр, 9.12.2012>.

<sup>22</sup> *Официальный сайт Партии регионов* <http://www.partyofregions.org.ua/about/symbolics/>.

the issues of local significance independently or under the liability of the ruling team relating to local government, according to Constitution and Legislation of Ukraine». In the opinion of S. Mohylniy, which we also support, the aforementioned position of law makes the problem of interaction urgent for the citizens and the authorities. The nature of the problem is the question «which measures to take in order to provide the members of the territorial gromada with the possibility of discussing the matters collectively as well as solving problems with their personal diligence and initiatives, and also in adjustment with the authority»<sup>23</sup>. Neither the legislation nor the authorities or scientists have given answers to this matter so far.

As an exception, and chiefly as an experiment, we can mention the successful experience of Berdyansk city (Zaporozhye Region), which is, in our opinion, one of the first cities in Ukraine that began to implement the principles of autonomy and subsidiarity. Thus, after the election of 1998 the local gromada began to implement the project named «partnership of gromada», which is a part of UN international programs, named «The future of cities in 21<sup>st</sup> century» and Ukrainian and American program «partnership of gromada for the expansion of the local government»<sup>24</sup>. The nature of the program was to offer the local gromada an independent administration by the city with the aim to achieve a more successful and efficient self-government. As a result, the city was divided into 12 self-governing micro-districts; the border between them resulted from the cultural and economic connections of district dwellers<sup>25</sup>. Among the city's achievements there can be mentioned the appearance of social and political power, named «social and political power union Berdyansk – our common home», which consists not of politicians, businessmen and narrow corporative circles, but of active civil forces, so called political force below. The appearance of these very civil political parties should become the impulse which can take the local government to a fundamentally new level of development, and which allows the regions to bear responsibility for the accepted solutions independently. But, unfortunately, not everyone understands this fact, for example, P. Matviyenko, the Governor of Zaporozhye Region, stated on the pages of «Bulletin of Public Prosecutor's Office» in 2011: «Control over authority powers implementation must be from the State, and not

<sup>23</sup> С. Могильний, *Інноваційні технології роботи місцевої влади...*, с. 150.

<sup>24</sup> В. Пархоменко, *Проблеми місцевого самоврядування в Україні 1990-х років*, Київ 1999, с. 160.

<sup>25</sup> С. Могильний, *Інноваційні технології роботи місцевої влади...*, с. 150.

from the local gromada»<sup>26</sup>. As we notice, authority representatives are oblivious to the citizens' right, which is declared by authority representatives themselves, to solve the matters of local significance.

The matter is also current in Poland, but in another aspect. In the opinion of many Polish, Ukrainian and world scientists, in the period of the collapse of the socialist system the Republic of Poland resumed its experience relating to the local government, which was suspended by the forty-year practice of the socialist system. Ukraine, however, has not only lost it, but in general has not even pointed the aims and tasks of development in terms of the local government and ways of reforming it. For example, in the Republic of Poland the fundamental problems of the local government, which are subject to immediate solution, are based on the following factors:

- excessive bureaucratization of civil control;
- distribution problem, relating to division of financial and budgetary resources on-sites and its financial property system, where public finances remain totally centralized, and administrative and territorial units function due to transfers from the central budget. Here, all the communal property belongs to gmina, whereas powiats and voivodeship nearly totally are dependent on the central budget<sup>27</sup>;
- the problem of political elections into the local government bodies (according to the Polish legislation, elections to the local government bodies are held by party lists, but whether the candidate is elected the deputy depends on the final result of the party which nominated him during the elections)<sup>28</sup>;
- high pass-through barrier at local elections (5% votes).

The aforementioned circle of problems puzzles many scientists in terms of methodology. Because of the above mentioned tendencies, the analysis of the local government problems in terms of budget and financial policy as well as elections can be restricted to the analysis of theoretical patterns. The cluster approach, introduced here, is very efficient in the practice of the Republic of Poland; this is proved indirectly by research by H. Deyneg relating to the range of problems in the sphere of public service. The analysis of the efficiency of the public service introduced by him helps to make a conclusion that the Polish administration

---

<sup>26</sup> П. Матвієнко, *Діяльність органів місцевого самоврядування як об'єкт контролю*, „Вісник прокуратури” 2011, № 12, с. 97–111.

<sup>27</sup> Л. Грицак (упоряд.), *Досвід місцевого самоврядування у посткомуністичних країнах Європи та роль молоді у його застосуванні в Україні*, Київ 2005, с. 45.

<sup>28</sup> Ibidem, с. 46.

tries to solve the bureaucratization problem of the local government and local budgets centralization by means of establishing a professional administrative management system. Thus, in Poland, there is a whole set of government programs, which are described in detail in the Act on the public service of the state and the training of public servants, which are supervised by the President of the State, the Head of the Public Service, by the General Directors' Office and by other public institutions<sup>29</sup>. The activities of these structures contain multi-stage training levels: central trainings, general trainings, special-purpose trainings and training of public servants by special programs<sup>30</sup>. Such a multilevel training points out the main foundations of a public servant – competence and profession prestige of a public servant. Polish voters also gain here since during the elections they are able to select competitive and innovations-oriented public servants.

In Ukraine the cluster approach defines problems similar to the Polish experience, but they are different in many ways. The application of the method helps to define the problem of local elections, competence of public servants and responsibility of the authority in the light of the information approach. The suggested approach includes a range of problems which remain out of sight of the local government and citizens, namely it is information, which should become the level of bilateral communication, which on the one hand, could help to solve social and political matters of the citizens on the local level, and on the other hand, could «open the authority for people», so that they can really understand the competence level of officials selected by them and, what is more, it could solve the problem of active participation of citizens in political processes. At present, this level helps to make a conclusion about stand-off from voters of the Ukrainian local government bodies. V. Yanukovich<sup>31</sup>, the President of Ukraine, stated this fact many times. But at the same time, no definite steps have been taken to reform the local government. In order to solve this problem, we suggest focusing on the information concept of P. Lyubchenko<sup>32</sup>. In general, the information concept proceeds from the mass media influence on society (adjust-

<sup>29</sup> Х.М. Дейнега, *Особливості підготовки державних службовців...*, с. 164.

<sup>30</sup> *Ibidem*, с. 165.

<sup>31</sup> Янукович говорить, что местные советы будоражат народ. Электронный доступ: [http://gazeta.ua/ru/articles/politics/\\_yanukovich-govorit-cto-mestnye-sovety-budorazhat-narod/385346](http://gazeta.ua/ru/articles/politics/_yanukovich-govorit-cto-mestnye-sovety-budorazhat-narod/385346), 8.12.2012

<sup>32</sup> П. Любченко, *Засади масової інформації як структурний елемент громадянського суспільства та їх вплив на місцеве самоврядування*, „Вісник Академії правових наук України” 2010, № 1 (60).

ment of bilateral communication between society and authority, focus on urgent problems, and also influence on voters' behavior), but in the context of Freedom House<sup>33</sup> version, it solves the following task circle:

- not to allow spontaneous nature of local government activity in mass media;
- to counteract the lack of long-term development strategy of local government bodies;
- to eliminate template and pathos totally (it should be emphasized that in Ukraine the mentioned problem become urgent during the political elections, when the mass media headlines show the messages, like: «A local council deputy has presented the first aid to the district», whereas, having a deputy status, he has not visited any session of his council) while placing the data about activity of local authorities;
- the matter should also contain the analysis and information about control over regulation of budget resources by local government bodies;
- to counteract the low level of the mass media efficiency by means of data presentation relating to the local government activity (this problem is particularly current in Ukraine, when the mass media, showing the activity of the local authorities, post factum showed the problem of schools closing in some Ukrainian regions).
- to create conditions for the local mass media activity with independent and international publications. Here it does not mean that the authority should take responsibilities in establishing communication between the mass media. It is better to talk about the authorities attending to information in the mass media as often as possible; in that case the focus should be on expert analysis in terms of even unpopular solutions.

We also agree with the opinion by P. Lyubchenko that civil society will only aggravate the problem circle, namely:

- local authority representatives refuse to give an answer to current questions;
- common non-publicity of the authority;
- local government officials are afraid of information leakage and relationship break-up with authorities;
- compulsory coordination of interviews or publication with supreme authority<sup>34</sup>.

---

<sup>33</sup> Ibidem, c. 75.

<sup>34</sup> Ibidem, c. 76.

As a result, the citizens receive information which is far from reality or is of a template nature. The mentioned problem helps to conceal the common incompetence of the authorities to answer the challenges in the region. As a consequence, the citizens prefer to trust rumour or scandalous publications connected with a definite official. According to P. Lyubchenko, there are the following topics in the foreground<sup>35</sup>:

- improper usage of budget resources by local officials;
- membership of local official in criminal circles or narrow corporative circles;
- income level of local official and their close relatives;
- level of political nepotism.

Many politicians and organizations suggested the idea of constant communication between the authority and the citizens, where the authority is supposed to be open in terms of information but this idea does not work. The reason is not the intention of the authority to open up to its electors, but electors themselves do not require it, or talking about the Ukrainian realia – they do not want to require. Here we can talk about the rapid disappointment of the elector in the local government, or in general, the electors do not understand the level of their participation. Hence, extending the borders of the information concept within the cluster approach we offer to solve the given problem not by analyzing its reasons, and not by a commonplace method – «to force the authority to keep its promises»; but by means of the cluster method itself, which could promote the local authority to inform the citizens about its intentions, and also in general to execute its policy in the direction understandable to the elector. Everyone is certain that the only filter which allows the citizens to separate the politicians who discredited themselves is the political election, which we have already mentioned. But here we suggest looking at them from another side, and on the basis of the criteria of election legitimization by means of a Congress of regional and local elections of EU government bodies<sup>36</sup>. It is particularly urgent for post-socialistic countries, where the citizens do not understand by which criteria it is possible to estimate the activity of local government bodies.

---

<sup>35</sup> Ibidem, c. 76.

<sup>36</sup> O. Protsyk, *Gagauz autonomy in Moldova: the real and the virtual in post-Soviet state Design*, [in:] M. Weller (ed.), *Asymmetric Autonomy as a Tool of Ethic Conflict Settlement*, University of Pennsylvania Press, Available at: <http://www.policy.hu/protsyk/Publications/ProtsykGagAutonomy09fx.pdf>, 8.12.2012

## **Results of the Research**

The result of the research is our suggestion to extend and apply the determinants of constant monitoring of the local Congress democracy in terms of regional and local elections of EU government bodies (it is necessary to mention that their focus is on the legitimization process of political elections). These determinants should be extended and applied to estimate the efficiency local government bodies on the basis of professional assessment of their activity. It should be separately noted that the fundament of our approach is the cluster approach (which is applied to a choice of assessment criteria) and the information. At present, we consider it very important to demonstrate the examination criteria and legitimization indicators of political elections concerning the Congress of regional and local elections of government bodies.

As we see from the table, the comparison criteria in general are based on a wide practice of civil participation (clauses b, c, d and f), and in countries with a transition democracy pattern they allow unfair politicians to implement a set of political manipulation techniques relating to electors; so this is a widely applied practice of efficient activity only before or during the elective process. However, we suggest not only a supplement to the table, but it is rather a direction vector of reforming the local government in post-socialistic countries. But the application of the cluster leaves an unsolved set of problems connected with efficiency assessment in terms of the activity of the local government bodies, which simultaneously performed two functions: on the one hand, it could let the authors avoid methodological limitation and on the other hand, it could make it a non-efficient practice for an official to work only during the elections.

For the purpose of eliminating this gap, we suggest supplementing the above pattern with the criteria developed by us, which underline the theoretical and practical levels of representative democracy (credibility, transparency, accessibility), but in the context of the activity of the local government bodies. This approach will define efficiency assessment in terms of the local government. We have come to such a conclusion in the course of analysis concerning decentralization principles, which serve as a further delegation of authority powers to local government bodies, as well as focus of EU authority on the development of subsidiarity principles in Europe. Thus, we have considered the analysis of such an aspect as «decentralization» only as audit initiative of civil society, opposition and forces which have not overcome the elective barrier, but have prestige with the citizens.

**Table 1. Examination criteria and legitimization indicators in the Congress of regional and local elections of EU government bodies concerning elections and referendum on local and regional levels in post-socialistic countries<sup>37</sup>**

Comparison Criteria	№	Indicators	Data Source
a). Legal election basis	1	Elections or appointment of local or regional government body	Data of official government bodies
	2	Election periodicity and term of office	Assessment of the experts
	3	Constitutional assignment of local authority to some concept	
	4	Active and passive elective rights on the local level	
	5	Provision of opposition with elective rights	
	6	Conditions for appeal of a violation	
b). Information awareness of elective process participants concerning the process of local and regional elections	7	Information awareness of election districts	
	8	Information awareness of candidates	
	9	Information awareness of electors	
c). Course of elective process or referendum	10	Accuracy of electoral register and volume of additional registers	
	11	Speed of election results' announcement	
	12	Availability of voting results	
d). Credit of electors and opposition to elections	13	Credit to conduction and results of election	
	14	Credit to particular politicians	
	15	Credit to parties – subjects of elective law	
	16	Credit to election observers	
	17	Credit to mass media during election campaign	

<sup>37</sup> С. Юрійчук, *Спостереження місцевих виборів на пострадянському просторі конгресом регіональних та місцевих органів влади Європи*, „Пам’ять століть. Україна” 2012, № 1–2, с. 169–170.

e) Electoral activity	18	Participation in regional election	Statistics and results of elections
		Participation in municipal election	
		Participation in mayor election	
		Participation in majority election	
		Participation in referendum	
f) Violations and conflicts in elective process	19	Occurrence and amount of complaints to higher authorities and courts concerning violations of elective rights	Statistics of elections and referenda, judicial statistics
	20	Recognition of elections' results by all the election subjects	
Conclusion concerning the delegation		Positive/negative/neutral	

**Table 2. Efficiency criteria of local government on the basis of the cluster approach.**

Comparison Criteria	№	Indicators	Data Source
a) Legitimacy of local government bodies	1	Population majority support of the authority in force in 1 or 3 years of its cadence	Monitoring of civil organizations and public opinion poll results
	2	Difference in the dynamics of authority (the pros and cons)	
	3	Level of citizens' participation in solving the local matters	
	4	Availability of conditions of a direct dialogue and communication between local government and citizens	
	5	Nepotism level in the formation of professional staff	
b) Efficiency of local government cooperating with the citizens	6	Correspondence of activity results with pre-election promises	Opinions of experts and independent mass media
	7	Ability to attract responsible officials to liability concerning non-fulfilment of pre-election promises	
	8	Implementation of administrative or criminal liability for the people responsible for the negative results of activity	
	9	Credibility of press services and interviews with officials	
	10	Ability to dispute the conclusions of local authority in court	

c) Format of participation and influence of citizens and opposition in discussing problematic matters	11	Opposition participation in development and implementation of political solutions	Data on official government bodies, opinions of experts and results of public opinion
		Citizens' participation in development and implementation of political solutions	
	12	Attracting independent experts to discuss and optimize the decisions	
	13	Financial control over local government from the society and opposition	
	14	Implemented solutions developed by opposition and citizens	
	15	Discussion and implementation of projects by forces which are not introduced on the local level	
	16	Possibility of audit concerning the activity of elective and appointed representatives in local government bodies on the initiative of citizens or opposition (not more frequently than 2 times per one term of office)	
	17	Possibility of audit concerning the activity of local government by foreign or independent audit organizations on the initiative of central authority (not more frequently than once per one term of office for elected bodies or once in 3 years for appointed officials)	
	18	Providing the political forces which are not introduced on the local level with alternative monitoring over the activity of the authority and opposition	
	d) Cooperation with political forces which are not introduced on the local level	19	
20		Providing the political forces which are not introduced on the local level with a possibility of examining the solutions developed by them, and participating in the discussion	

e) Qualification improvement of officials	21	Availability of local and nation-wide probation programs and qualification improvement, as well as real opportunity for authority representatives and opposition to participate	Data of official authorities and experts' opinions with an analysis of the reasons
	22	Availability and implementation of interregional and international programs concerning qualification improvement, as well as their availability to oppositional forces	
f) International and economic activity of local authority	23	Attracted foreign investment of capital into region	-
	24	% in difference between the region's income and transfers from the state budget	
	25	% deposited by the region of the country in GDP (gross domestic product)	
	26	% in difference concerning incomes and expenses of the region, subject to allocation in the national budget	
g) Innovative activity	27	Investment projects developed by local authorities	-
	28	Innovative projects introduced by the authority in % correlation with unrealizable projects	
Conclusion of the experts		Positive/negative/neutral analysis	-
Monitoring of public opinion		Credibility / inaccessibility / corruption of authority	-
Results of political election		Political force, the candidate has been re-elected, or elective barrier has not been overcome	-

As we see from the table, the efficiency analysis of the local government entirely envelops the problems described in the present article, but it sets new tasks of heuristic and scientific and methodological research. Among them we can point out the following tasks: how to optimize the criteria introduced by us; and probably the most principal question – how the society itself shall react to the proposed innovation. The spiral pattern concerning the dynamics of the local government gives answers to these questions.

The main point of this approach, according to W. Graves<sup>38</sup> and W. Sydorenko<sup>39</sup>, is that «noetic dynamics displays the interaction between external environment, society, culture and a human himself (neurobiological level of consciousness: «brain», «memory», «the inner world»)»<sup>40</sup> ... according to the law of spiral dynamics, where the first spiral is a gradation of life conditions, the second spiral describes the gradation of psychological and cognitive processes»<sup>41</sup>. In our opinion, it is reasonable to add the third spiral, in which the above mentioned components on the level of consciousness accumulate the energy of the required changes, which also generates the process of adaptation concerning society, the cultural sphere and a human himself to the new life realia. Thus, the third spiral simultaneously acts as a starting stage and a completion stage of a definite pattern, and the main point of the local government should include flexibility in terms of innovations. Otherwise, the mentioned spirals will go backwards, which will not mean creating and adapting, but destroying and restoring the archaic aspects of the old system. In Ukraine, the local government is facing such conditions nowadays, which explains the attempts of the authorities to restore the outdated administrative and command system; its mission is to solve the economic matters, and not to solve the local problems comprehensively and successively. As a result, we observe the indifference of the citizens in solving their problems, and even the local government institutions are perceived by citizens as «something high and inaccessible». Everybody loses in this situation: both the state, because without the initiative from

<sup>38</sup> C.W. Graves, *The Never Ending Quest: Dr.Clare W.Graves Explores Human Nature*, Ch.C. Cowan, N. Todorovic (eds.), *The Never Ending Quest*: Santa Barbara, CA: ECLET Publishing 2005, p. 27.

<sup>39</sup> В.В.Сидоренко, В.І. Слуговін, *Еволюція місцевого самоврядування з точки зору спіральної динаміки*, [в:] О.С. Поважний (ред.), *Удосконалення механізмів державного управління соціально-економічним розвитком підприємств і галузей економіки*, Донецьк 2011, с. 161.

<sup>40</sup> *Ibidem*, с. 162.

<sup>41</sup> C.W. Graves, *The Never Ending Quest...*, p. 150.

below there is no dynamics in its development, and civil society itself, because it is partially and in some cases fully isolated from access to the authority. The approach discussed here serves as a theoretical and practical level, but we observe its partial implementation in EU countries. The implementation of this approach goes backwards in Ukraine, which is shown by the Elections to the local government bodies of 2010 and Parliamentary Elections of 2012, where the problem of reforming the local government was introduced superficially and it was limited to the matters concerning replacement of officials, and not the real reforms.

Thus, the approach introduced in the present article is innovatory in many aspects and requires further examination. Our next research will be aimed at the search for methodological adaptation relating to cluster, information and spiral dynamics pattern concerning the analysis of the local government. Simultaneously, we will also develop another approach to the analysis and research in the sphere of the local government; in general, it will help to avoid methodological monotony towards research in the sphere of the local government.

## **ABSTRACTS**

The proposed research is focused on the problem of interaction and communication of the local government with institutions of the political system and the civil society. The research includes up-to-date concepts and categories in modern political science, such as: local government in the context of cluster analysis and spiral dynamics and information approach to the analysis of the local government. A separate emphasis was placed on the research methodology, which is based on a poly-variety of theoretical approaches and methods with an analysis of their strong and weak points.

The presented cluster approach is widely applied not only to the basic problems of the local government (budget sphere, local finances and problems of local and central authority interrelation), but also to the special aspects – political elections, perception and trust of the civil society in the local government institutions.

*Nikołaj Prymusz, Jurij Kowal*

## WIELOWYMIAROWA ANALIZA REFORMY SAMORZĄDU TERYTORIALNEGO NA UKRAINIE I W POLSCE W KONTEKŚCIE INNOWACJI I PERSPEKTYWY ROZWOJU

W zaproponowanym badaniu akcent położono na problemie współdziałania i komunikowania systemu samorządu lokalnego z instytucjami systemu politycznego i społeczeństwa obywatelskiego. Badanie operuje aktualnymi we współczesnych naukach politycznych pojęciami i kategoriami, takimi jak: system samorządu lokalnego w kontekście analizy i spiralnej dynamiki, a także informacyjne podejście do analizy samorządu lokalnego. Oddzielny akcent położono na metodologii badania. Bazuje się na wielowariantowości teoretycznych podejść i metod, z analizą silnych i słabych stron każdej z ich.

Przedstawiona w artykule klastrowa metoda jest wykorzystywana nie tylko przy analizie bazowych problemów samorządu lokalnego (system budżetowy, system finansów lokalnych, problem współdziałania władz lokalnych z władzą centralną), ale jest także używana do specjalnych zagadnień – wybory polityczne, odbiór i zaufanie społeczeństwa obywatelskiego do instytucji samorządu lokalnego.

**SŁOWA KLUCZOWE:** *system samorządu lokalnego, lokalna władza, reformowanie, samoorganizacja ludności, system finansów lokalnych, lokalne wybory*

## Bibliography

- M. Бутко, О. Зеленська, С. Зеленський, А. Літош, *Фінансова база діяльності органів місцевого самоврядування в системі критеріїв репрезентивності адміністративно-територіальних районів України*, „Економіст” 2011, № 11 (301).
- Х.М. Дейнега, *Особливості підготовки державних службовців у Республіки Польща*, „Економіка та держава” 2011, № 2 (лютий).
- П. Любченко, *Засади масової інформації як структурний елемент громадянського суспільства та їх вплив на місцеве самоврядування*, „Вісник Академії правових наук України” 2010, № 1 (60).
- S. Michałowski (red.), *Samorząd terytorialny III Rzeczypospolitej. Dziesięć lat doświadczeń*, Lublin 2002.
- О. Павлюк, *Роль політичних партій у формуванні представницьких органів місцевого самоврядування в Україні під час виборів 2010 року*, „Пам’ять століть. Планета” 2012, № 1–2.

- В. Пархоменко, *Проблеми місцевого самоврядування в Україні 1990-х років*, Київ 1999.
- О.В. Перевознікова, *Роль місцевих органів влади у процесі створення та функціонування кластерів*, [в:] *Удосконалення механізмів державного управління соціально-економічним розвитком підприємств і галузей економіки*: зб.наук.праць, Донецьк 2011.
- Л. Рибчинська, *Концептуальні підходи до формування кластерів на Хмельниччині*, „Економіст” 2008, № 10.
- J. Sallet, E. Paisley, *Innovation Clusters Create Competitive Communities*, „Huff Post Social News” September 21, 2009.
- O. Solvell, G. Lindqvist, Ch. Ketels, *The Cluster Initiative Greenbook*, The Competitiveness Institute/VINNOVA, Gothenburg 2003.